Can Market Shaping Policies promote Autonomy?

Lukas Fuchs 15th February 2020

Raz on Autonomy & Valuable Options

- Being part author of one's life
- Conditions: i) capacity, ii) availability of valuable options, iii) independence
- Valuable options depend on existence of social forms, "common good"
- Autonomy as reason for state action (as opposed to inaction)
- In order to be valuable, an option must be morally acceptable:

"Imagine a person who can pursue an occupation of his choice but at the price of committing murder for each option he rejects. First he has to choose whether to become an electrician. He can refuse provided he kills one person. Then he is offered a career in dentistry, which again he is free to refuse if he kills another person, and so on. (...) I think it will be generally agreed that in this case the life of the person in my example is not autonomous and that his choice and the nature of his options are enough to show that he is not. (...)

Autonomy requires a choice of goods. A choice between good and evil is not enough."

- Raz (1986: chapter 14)

Economic Dependence

- Most valuable options depend on provision of goods and services.
- Example: In order to become a good philosopher, one has to go to conferences. Other necessary goods: electricity, electronic devices, food, etc.
- Given that most options depend on economic goods, their morally acceptable provision is necessary for an option to be valuable

Moral Evaluation of Markets

- Evaluation of markets in terms of (sociological) consequences (Satz 2010)
- A market is not just a type of transaction: production, marketing, shaping of preferences, innovation
- Electricity, food, transport. Co2 emissions, harm to others.

Market Shaping Policies

- "A policy aimed at creating markets that were previously absent due to technological limitations, economic viability or risk."
- Examples: German Energiewende, the iPhone (Mazzucato 2016)

Objection

- Isn't this just Market Failure theorizing?
- Considerations of "autonomy" introduce moral evaluation
- Policy response aims for structural transformation